



CITY OF SAUSALITO

420 Litho Street • Sausalito, CA 94965
Telephone: (415) 289-4100
www.ci.sausalito.ca.us

August 8, 2016

John Mann, Foreperson
Marin County Civil Grand Jury
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 275
San Rafael, CA 94903

RE: Grand Jury Response – Marin's Hidden Human Sex Trafficking
Challenge: *It's Happening in our Backyard*

Dear Mr. Mann:

At their meeting of July 26, the Sausalito City Council reviewed and approved the response to the Grand Jury Report "Marin's Hidden Human Sex Trafficking Challenge: *It's Happening in our Backyard*".

Enclosed you will find our response, along with the response from Lieutenant William Fraass, on behalf of the Chief of Police. By copy of this letter, Judge Simmons will also receive one copy of the report.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me.

Respectfully,

Debbie Pagliaro
Temporary City Clerk

cc: Judge Kelly Simmons

FAX NUMBERS:

Administration: (415) 289-4167
Recreation: (415) 289-4189

Community Development: (415) 339-2256

Library: (415) 331-7943
Public Works: (415) 289-4138

RESPONSE TO GRAND JURY REPORT FORM

Report Title: Marin's Hidden Human Sex Trafficking Challenge: *It's Happening in our Backyard*

Report Date: June 16, 2016

Agenda Date: July 26, 2016

Response by: Sausalito City Council Title: Debbie Pagliaro, Temporary City Clerk

FINDINGS

- I (we) agree with the findings numbered: F1, F3, F6, F9, F10, F13
- I (we) disagree *partially* with the findings numbered: F2, F4, F5, F7, F11, F12
- I (we) disagree *wholly* with the findings numbered: F8

(Attach a statement specifying any portions of the findings that are disputed; include an explanation of the reasons therefor.)

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Recommendations numbered R2 have been implemented.
(Attach a summary describing the implemented actions.)
- Recommendations numbered R1, R4 have not yet been implemented, but will be implemented in the future.
(Attach a timeframe for the implementation.)
- Recommendations numbered _____ require further analysis.
(Attach an explanation and the scope and parameters of an analysis or study, and a timeframe for the matter to be prepared for discussion by the officer or director of the agency or department being investigated or reviewed, including the governing body of the public agency when applicable. This timeframe shall not exceed six months from the date of publication of the grand jury report.)
- Recommendations numbered R3, R5, R6, R7 will not be implemented because they are not warranted or are not reasonable.

(Attach an explanation.)

Date: Aug 8, 2016 Signed: Debbie Pagliaro

Number of pages attached 3

CITY OF SAUSALITO

ATTACHMENT TO
Marin's Hidden Human Sex Trafficking Challenge: *It's Happening in our Backyard*

Findings – Statement re: F1 through F13:

F1. Human sex trafficking is mostly unrecognized, under-reported, and rarely subject to intervention in Marin. AGREE.

F2. A significant number of human sex trafficking victims are from Marin, not just transients imported from other areas. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THERE IS NOT SUFFICIENT INFORMATION AVAILABLE TO DETERMINE THE NUMBER OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING VICTIMS IN MARIN COUNTY, THEREFORE THIS STATEMENT MAY OR MAY NOT BE ACCURATE.

F3. Reports from two Marin County victim advocate organizations show that approximately 30% of the victims they aid are under the age of 18. AGREE.

F4. Some Marin County law enforcement officers still believe some human trafficking victims are criminals. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THE OFFICERS OF THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT TREAT SURVIVORS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS VICTIMS, NOT CRIMINALS. THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT CANNOT SPEAK FOR OFFICERS FROM OTHER LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES.

F5. State law mandates that officers receive two hours of training on human trafficking and some Marin agencies may not be complying with this law. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. OFFICERS FROM THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT HAVE RECEIVED TWO HOURS OF TRAINING ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING VIA THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T APPROVED TRAINING VIDEO. THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT DOES NOT KNOW WHAT LEVEL OF TRAINING OTHER AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING THEIR OFFICERS.

F6. Training of Marin County law enforcement on the Marin County Uniform Law Enforcement Protocol for Human Trafficking has been inconsistent across agencies. AGREE.

F7. Law enforcement officers and others who are closest to human trafficking believe the California mandated two-hour POST training video on human trafficking is not sufficient. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THERE IS NOT SUFFICIENT INFORMATION AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT OR DISPUTE THIS STATEMENT. HOWEVER, THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T MANDATED TRAINING IS A SIGNIFICANT MOVE IN EDUCATING OFFICERS.

F8. Marin law enforcement agencies rarely use multidisciplinary training, incorporating collaboration between Children Family Services (CFS), the District Attorney, law enforcement experts, and possibly victims. DISAGREE WHOLLY. MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES HAVE USED MULTI-DISCIPLINARY APPROACHES TO

VARIOUS CRIMINAL AND QUALITY OF LIFE ISSUES IN PAST SITUATIONS WHEN CIRCUMSTANCES CALLED FOR THEM. IN REGARDS TO THIS REPORT, THE MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES ARE WORKING IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE MARIN COUNTY COALITION TO END HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND TO EDUCATE OFFICERS ABOUT THIS PROBLEM.

F9. Training for firefighters and EMS professionals in recognizing human trafficking victims and reporting the crime is inconsistent in Marin. AGREE.

F10. It is difficult to determine the extent of human trafficking in Marin because of the inconsistent classification and definitions of the crime, as well as the lack of a central clearinghouse for this data. AGREE.

F11. The Marin County school districts do not provide education on a systematic basis for students, parents, and teachers in recognizing signs of human trafficking. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. NEITHER THE CITY OF SAUSALITO, NOR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT IS ABLE TO ADDRESS THE LEVEL OF EDUCATION BY SCHOOL DISTRICTS IN MARIN COUNTY.

F12. Human trafficking outreach has been fragmented and is currently insufficient in reaching critical audiences. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. OUTREACH IS IN ITS BEGINNING STAGES THROUGHOUT MARIN COUNTY.

F13. The Marin County Coalition to End Human Trafficking Coalition needs dedicated resources to make it more effective. ,AGREE.

Recommendations – Statement re: R1 through R7:

R1. All law enforcement officers should be consistently trained in the Marin County Uniform Law Enforcement Protocol for Human Trafficking. THIS RECOMMENDATION HAS NOT YET BEEN IMPLEMENTED. PER THE PRESIDENT OF THE MARIN COUNTY POLICE CHIEF'S ASSOCIATION, TRAINING OF LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS IN REGARDS TO THE MARIN COUNTY UNIFORM LAW ENFORCEMENT PROTOCOL FOR HUMAN TRAFFICKING IS ESTIMATED TO OCCUR WITHIN THE NEXT SIX (6) MONTHS.

R2. All Marin law enforcement agency heads should ensure their officers receive the California mandated two hour human trafficking training. THIS RECOMMENDATION WAS IMPLEMENTED. SAUSALITO POLICE OFFICERS RECEIVED TWO HOURS OF TRAINING ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING VIA THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T APPROVED TRAINING VIDEO.

R3. The Board of Supervisors should convene a local group of human trafficking experts (including CFS, law enforcement subject experts, FBI, victim advocates, DA's and perhaps a victim) to create a multidisciplinary training presentation. This training should include the unique roles of all County personnel, resources, and processes in addressing human trafficking. Additional resources will be needed to support this training as none are devoted to this task now. This training should include information

on the trafficking of females and males, as well as LGBTQ. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, NOT THE CITY OF SAUSALITO OR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT. NEITHER THE CITY, NOR THE POLICE DEPARTMENT HAS THE AUTHORITY OR THE ABILITY TO ACT ON THIS IN ANY MATTER.

R4. Once this multi-disciplinary training package is completed, Marin County law enforcement agencies should ensure that all Marin law enforcement officers be trained. THIS RECOMMENDATION HAS NOT BEEN IMPLEMENTED DUE TO THE FACT A MULTI-DISCIPLINARY TRAINING HAS NOT BEEN COMPLETELY DEVELOPED. ONCE A TRAINING PACKAGE HAS BEEN DEVELOPED, THE TRAINING WILL BE IMPLEMENTED FOR MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS. PER THE PRESIDENT OF THE MARIN COUNTY POLICE CHIEF'S ASSOCIATION, THIS TRAINING IS ESTIMATED TO OCCUR WITHIN THE NEXT SIX (6) MONTHS.

R5. Marin County fire departments should ensure that all EMS personnel are trained in recognizing human trafficking and how to report it, and incorporate this in their annual training. DUE TO THE FACT THE SOUTHERN MARIN FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT SERVES THE CITY OF SAUSALITO, WE DEFER TO DISTRICT'S RESPONSE REGARDING THIS RECOMMENDATION.

R6. The Board of Supervisors should fund the creation of a database that systematically tracks adult and minor victims, using consistent classification and shared definitions to properly identify the victim and the crime, as well as document its prevalence. Data should be gathered from any organization dealing with trafficking victims, including law enforcement agencies, government agencies (e.g. Marin County Health & Human Services), civic organizations, and victim advocate organizations. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, NOT THE CITY OF SAUSALITO OR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT. NEITHER THE CITY, NOR THE POLICE DEPARTMENT HAS THE AUTHORITY OR THE ABILITY TO ACT ON THIS IN ANY MANNER. HOWEVER, ANY CREATION OF A DATABASE WOULD NEED CAREFUL ANALYSIS. THE AGENCIES THAT COLLECT DATA WOULD NEED TO CAREFULLY COLLABORATE TO AVOID DUPLICATION OF WORK. IN ADDITION, SHARING VICTIM INFORMATION IS PROHIBITED BY LAW DUE TO THEIR CONFIDENTIALITY.

R7. Marin County Office of Education should work with the Marin County School/Law Enforcement Partnership to develop educational programs to ensure that students, parents, and teachers are trained in recognizing the signs of human trafficking and where they can find help. THIS RECOMMENDATION CANNOT BE IMPLEMENTED BY THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT BECAUSE, AS A LOCAL AGENCY, THE ABILITY TO MAKE A COUNTY WIDE PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE MARIN COUNTY OFFICE OF EDUCATION AND ALL MARIN COUNTY SCHOOLS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT IS OUT OF OUR SCOPE OF RESPONSIBILITIES. THE INDIVIDUAL SCHOOL BOARDS IN MARIN COUNTY SHOULD DETERMINE HOW TO IMPLEMENT THIS RECOMMENDATION. HOWEVER, EDUCATION MATERIALS ARE CURRENTLY IN PLACE THROUGHOUT THE SCHOOL DISTRICTS FOR STUDENTS, PARENTS, AND TEACHERS.

RESPONSE TO GRAND JURY REPORT

MADONIS HIDDEN HUMAN SEX TRAFFICKING

Report Title: CHALLENGE, IT'S HAPPENING IN OUR BACKYARD

Report Date: 6-23-16

Agenda Date: 7-26-16

Response by: WILLIAM FROESS Title: LIEUTENANT, SONOMA POLICE

FINDINGS

- I (we) agree with the findings numbered: F1, F3, F6, F9, F10, F13
- I (we) disagree *partially* with the findings numbered: F2, F4, F5, F7, F11, F12
- I (we) disagree *wholly* with the findings numbered: F8

(Attach a statement specifying any portions of the findings that are disputed; include an explanation of the reasons therefor.)

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Recommendations numbered R2 have been implemented.
(Attach a summary describing the implemented actions.)
- Recommendations numbered R1, R4 have not yet been implemented, but will be implemented in the future.
(Attach a timeframe for the implementation.)
- Recommendations numbered _____ require further analysis.
(Attach an explanation and the scope and parameters of an analysis or study, and a timeframe for the matter to be prepared for discussion by the officer or director of the agency or department being investigated or reviewed, including the governing body of the public agency when applicable. This timeframe shall not exceed six months from the date of publication of the grand jury report.)
- Recommendations numbered R3, R5, R6, R7 will not be implemented because they are not warranted or are not reasonable.
(Attach an explanation.)

Date: 7-20-16 Signed: [Signature]

Number of pages attached _____

FINDINGS

F1. Human sex trafficking is mostly unrecognized, under-reported, and rarely subject to intervention in Marin. AGREE.

F2. A significant number of human sex trafficking victims are from Marin, not just transients imported from other areas. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THERE IS NOT SUFFICIENT INFORMATION AVAILABLE TO DETERMINE THE NUMBER OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING VICTIMS IN MARIN COUNTY THEREFORE THIS STATEMENT MAY OR MAY NOT BE ACCURATE.

F3. Reports from two Marin County victim advocate organizations show that approximately 30% of the victims they aid are under the age of 18. AGREE.

F4. Some Marin County law enforcement officers still believe some human trafficking victims are criminals. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THE OFFICERS OF THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT TREAT SURVIVORS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS VICTIMS NOT CRIMINALS. THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT CAN NOT SPEAK FOR OFFICERS FROM OTHER LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES.

F5. State law mandates that officers receive two hours of training on human trafficking and some Marin agencies may not be complying with this law. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. OFFICERS FROM THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT HAVE RECEIVED TWO HOURS OF TRAINING ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING VIA THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T APPROVED TRAINING VIDEO. THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT DOES NOT KNOW WHAT LEVEL OF TRAINING OTHER AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING THEIR OFFICERS.

F6. Training of Marin County law enforcement on the Marin County Uniform Law Enforcement Protocol for Human Trafficking has been inconsistent across agencies. AGREE.

F7. Law enforcement officers and others who are closest to human trafficking believe the California mandated two-hour POST training video on human trafficking is not sufficient. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THERE IS NOT SUFFICIENT INFORMATION AVAILABLE TO SUPPORT OR DISPUTE THIS STATEMENT. HOWEVER, THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T MANDATED TRAINING IS A SIGNIFICANT MOVE IN EDUCATING OFFICERS.

F8. Marin law enforcement agencies rarely use multidisciplinary training, incorporating collaboration between Children Family Services (CFS), the District Attorney, law enforcement experts, and possibly victims. DISAGREE WHOLLY. MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES HAVE USED MULTI-DISCIPLINARY APPROACHES TO VARIOUS CRIMINAL AND QUALITY OF LIFE ISSUES IN PAST SITUATIONS WHEN CIRCUMSTANCES CALLED FOR THEM. IN REGARDS TO THIS REPORT, THE MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES ARE WORKING IN CONJUNCTION WITH

THE MARIN COUNTY COALITION TO END HUMAN TRAFFICKING TO EDUCATE OFFICERS ABOUT THIS PROBLEM.

F9. Training for firefighters and EMS professionals in recognizing human trafficking victims and reporting the crime is inconsistent in Marin. AGREE.

F10. It is difficult to determine the extent of human trafficking in Marin because of the inconsistent classification and definitions of the crime, as well as the lack of a central clearinghouse for this data. AGREE.

F11. The Marin County school districts do not provide education on a systematic basis for students, parents, and teachers in recognizing signs of human trafficking. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. THE CITY OF SAUSALITO NOR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT IS ABLE TO ADDRESS THE LEVEL OF EDUCATION BY SCHOOL DISTRICTS IN MARIN COUNTY.

F12. Human trafficking outreach has been fragmented and is currently insufficient in reaching critical audiences. DISAGREE PARTIALLY. OUTREACH IS IN ITS BEGINNING STAGES THROUGHOUT MARIN COUNTY.

F13. The Marin County Coalition to End Human Trafficking Coalition needs dedicated resources to make it more effective. AGREE.

RECOMMENDATIONS

R1. All law enforcement officers should be consistently trained in the Marin County Uniform Law Enforcement Protocol for Human Trafficking. THIS RECOMMENDATION HAS NOT YET BEEN IMPLEMENTED. PER THE PRESIDENT OF THE MARIN COUNTY POLICE CHIEF'S ASSOCIATION, TRAINING OF LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS IN REGARDS TO THE MARIN COUNTY UNIFORM LAW ENFORCEMENT PROTOCOL FOR HUMAN TRAFFICKING IS ESTIMATED TO OCCUR WITHIN THE NEXT SIX (6) MONTHS.

R2. All Marin law enforcement agency heads should ensure their officers receive the California mandated two hour human trafficking training. THIS RECOMMENDATION WAS IMPLEMENTED. SAUSALITO POLICE OFFICERS RECEIVED TWO HOURS OF TRAINING ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING VIA THE CALIFORNIA P.O.S.T APPROVED TRAINING VIDEO.

R3. The Board of Supervisors should convene a local group of human trafficking experts (including CFS, law enforcement subject experts, FBI, victim advocates, DA's and perhaps a victim) to create a multidisciplinary training presentation. This training should include the unique roles of all County personnel, resources, and processes in addressing human trafficking. Additional resources will be needed to support this training as none are devoted to this task now. This training should include information on the trafficking of females and males, as well as LGBTQ. THIS RECOMMENDATION

IS FOR THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, NOT THE CITY OF SAUSALITO OR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT. THE CITY NOR THE POLICE DEPARTMENT HAS THE AUTHORITY OR THE ABILITY TO ACT ON THIS IN ANY MATTER.

R4. Once this multi-disciplinary training package is completed, Marin County law enforcement agencies should ensure that all Marin law enforcement officers be trained. THIS RECOMMENDATION HAS NOT BEEN IMPLEMENTED DUE TO THE FACT A MULTI-DISCIPLINARY TRAINING HAS NOT BEEN COMPLETELY DEVELOPED. ONCE A TRAINING PACKAGE HAS BEEN DEVELOPED, THE TRAINING WILL BE IMPLEMENTED FOR MARIN LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS. PER THE PRESIDENT OF THE MARIN COUNTY POLICE CHIEF'S ASSOCIATION, THIS TRAINING IS ESTIMATED TO OCCUR WITHIN THE NEXT SIX (6) MONTHS.

R5. Marin County fire departments should ensure that all EMS personnel are trained in recognizing human trafficking and how to report it, and incorporate this in their annual training. DUE TO THE FACT THE SOUTHERN MARIN FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT SERVES THE CITY OF SAUSALITO, WE DEFER TO DISTRICT'S RESPONSE REGARDING THIS RECOMMENDATION.

R6. The Board of Supervisors should fund the creation of a database that systematically tracks adult and minor victims, using consistent classification and shared definitions to properly identify the victim and the crime, as well as document it prevalence. Data should be gathered from any organization dealing with trafficking victims, including law enforcement agencies, government agencies (e.g. Marin County Health & Human Services), civic organizations, and victim advocate organizations. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, NOT THE CITY OF SAUSALITO OR THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT. THE CITY NOR THE POLICE DEPARTMENT HAS THE AUTHORITY OR THE ABILITY TO ACT ON THIS IN ANY MANNER. HOWEVER, ANY CREATION OF A DATABASE WOULD NEED CAREFUL ANALYSIS. THE AGENCIES THAT COLLECT DATA WOULD NEED TO CAREFULLY COLLABORATE TO AVOID DUPLICATION OF WORK. IN ADDITION, SHARING VICTIM INFORMATION IS PROHIBITED BY LAW DUE TO THEIR CONFIDENTIALITY.

R7. Marin County Office of Education should work with the Marin County School/Law Enforcement Partnership to develop educational programs to ensure that students, parents, and teachers are trained in recognizing the signs of human trafficking and where they can find help. THIS RECOMMENDATION CAN NOT BE IMPLEMENTED BY THE SAUSALITO POLICE DEPARTMENT BECAUSE AS A LOCAL AGENCY THE ABILITY TO MAKE A COUNTY WIDE PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE MARIN COUNTY OFFICE OF EDUCATION AND ALL MARIN COUNTY SCHOOLS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT IS OUT OF OUR SCOPE OF RESPONSIBILITIES. THE INDIVIDUAL SCHOOL BOARDS IN MARIN COUNTY SHOULD DETERMINE HOW TO IMPLEMENT THIS RECOMMENDATION. HOWEVER, EDUCATION MATERIALS

ARE CURRENTLY IN PLACE THROUGHOUT THE SCHOOL DISTRICTS FOR STUDENTS, PARENTS, AND TEACHERS.